|                                       | Exemplary<br>4   | Proficient<br>3   | Marginal<br>2   | Unacceptable<br>1   |
|---------------------------------------|--|---|---|---|
| Quality of<br>Hypothesis              | Exceptional level of all of the<br>following:<br>- Clear articulation of research<br>questions<br>- Designing a hypothesis that is<br>precise, meaningful and falsifiable  | Proficient/ mastery level of most<br>of the following:<br>- Clear articulation of research<br>questions<br>- Designing a hypothesis that is<br>precise, meaningful and falsifiable  | Marginal/borderline level of most<br>of the following:<br>- Clear articulation of research<br>questions<br>- Designing a hypothesis that is<br>precise, meaningful and falsifiable  | Unacceptable level of most of the<br>following:<br>- Clear articulation of research<br>questions<br>- Designing a hypothesis that is<br>precise, meaningful and falsifiable   |
| Experimental<br>Design &<br>Procedure | Exceptional level of all of the<br>following:<br>- Experimental design that<br>evaluates the selected phenomena<br>and considers the appropriate<br>choice of between and within<br>subject design<br>- Relevant independent and<br>dependant variables with the<br>appropriate levels and use of<br>manipulation checks<br>- Minimizing confounding variables<br>- Considering internal and external<br>validity<br>- Experimental design by<br>acquiring/designing the appropriate<br>apparatus/materials<br>- Enabling researchers to replicate<br>the experiment<br>- Extensibility and building on the<br>existing body of literature | Proficient/ mastery level of most<br>of the following:<br>- Experimental design that<br>evaluates the selected phenomena<br>and considers the appropriate<br>choice of between and within<br>subject design<br>- Relevant independent and<br>dependant variables with the<br>appropriate levels and use of<br>manipulation checks<br>- Minimizing confounding variables<br>- Considering internal and external<br>validity<br>- Experimental design by<br>acquiring/designing the appropriate<br>apparatus/materials<br>- Enabling researchers to replicate<br>the experiment<br>- Extensibility and building on<br>existing body of literature | Marginal/borderline level of most<br>of the following:<br>- Experimental design that<br>evaluates the selected phenomena<br>and considers the appropriate<br>choice of between and within<br>subject design<br>- Relevant independent and<br>dependant variables with the<br>appropriate levels and use of<br>manipulation checks<br>- Minimizing confounding variables<br>- Considering internal and external<br>validity<br>- Experimental design by<br>acquiring/designing the appropriate<br>apparatus/materials<br>- Enabling researchers to replicate<br>the experiment<br>- Extensibility and building on<br>existing body of literature | Unacceptable level of most of the<br>following:<br>- Experimental design that evaluates<br>the selected phenomena and<br>considers the appropriate choice of<br>between and within subject design<br>- Relevant independent and<br>dependant variables with the<br>appropriate levels and use of<br>manipulation checks<br>- Minimizing confounding variables<br>- Considering internal and external<br>validity<br>- Experimental design by<br>acquiring/designing the appropriate<br>apparatus/materials<br>- Enabling researchers to replicate<br>the experiment<br>- Extensibility and building on<br>existing body of literature |

## Methodology: Experiment

| Participant<br>Selection and<br>Ethical<br>Considerations | Exceptional level of all of the<br>following:<br>- Ethical participant considerations<br>(i.e., considerations of vulnerable<br>participants, informed consent,<br>privacy, confidentiality, maintaining<br>trust, ability to opt out at all times,<br>value of participant's time)<br>- Consideration of the appropriate<br>user population (i.e., based on the<br>availability of resources, the power<br>of statistical tests to be used, and<br>representativeness of population) | Proficient/mastery level of most<br>of the following:<br>- Ethical participant considerations<br>(i.e., considerations of vulnerable<br>participants, informed consent,<br>privacy, confidentiality, maintaining<br>trust, ability to opt out at all times,<br>value of participant's time)<br>- Consideration of the appropriate<br>user population (i.e., based on the<br>availability of resources, the power<br>of statistical tests to be used, and<br>representativeness of population) | Marginal/borderline level of most<br>of the following:<br>- Ethical participant considerations<br>(i.e., considerations of vulnerable<br>participants, informed consent,<br>privacy, confidentiality, maintaining<br>trust, ability to opt out at all times,<br>value of participant's time)<br>- Consideration of the appropriate<br>user population (i.e., based on the<br>availability of resources, the power<br>of statistical tests to be used, and<br>representativeness of population) | Unacceptable level of most of the<br>following:<br>- Ethical participant considerations<br>(i.e., considerations of vulnerable<br>participants, informed consent,<br>privacy, confidentiality, maintaining<br>trust, ability to opt out at all times,<br>value of participant's time)<br>- Consideration of the appropriate<br>user population (i.e., based on the<br>availability of resources, the power of<br>statistical tests to be used, and<br>representativeness of population) |
|---|---|---|--|---|
| Analysis  | Exceptional level of all of the   | Proficient/mastery level of most  | Marginal/borderline level of most  | Unacceptable level of most of the   |
|   | following:  | of the following:   | of the following:  | following:  |
|   | - Focus on the appropriate  | - Focus on the appropriate  | - Focus on the appropriate   | - Focus on the appropriate  |
|   | quantitative data   | quantitative data   | quantitative data  | quantitative data   |
|   | - Choice of statistical tests   | - Choice of statistical tests   | - Choice of statistical tests  | - Choice of statistical tests   |
|   | - Addressment of the research   | - Addressment of the research   | - Addressment of the research  | - Addressment of the research   |
|   | questions   | questions   | questions  | questions   |
|   | - Minimization of statistical and   | - Minimization of statistical and   | - Minimization of statistical and  | - Minimization of statistical and   |
|   | confirmation bias   | confirmation bias   | confirmation bias  | confirmation bias   |

| Scope of<br>Claim and<br>Supporting<br>Evidence | Exceptional level of all of the<br>following:<br>- Clearly articulating scope<br>- Supporting evidence that matches<br>the scope of the hypothesis<br>- Claims that are clearly articulated<br>and supported with statistically<br>significant results or acceptance of<br>the null hypothesis                                   | Proficient/mastery level of most<br>of the following:<br>- Clearly articulating scope<br>- Supporting evidence that matches<br>the scope of the hypothesis<br>- Claims that are clearly articulated<br>and supported with statistically<br>significant results or acceptance of<br>the null hypothesis                                   | Marginal/borderline level of most<br>of the following:<br>- Clearly articulating scope<br>- Supporting evidence that matches<br>the scope of the hypothesis<br>- Claims that are clearly articulated<br>and supported with statistically<br>significant results or acceptance of<br>the null hypothesis                                    | Unacceptable level of most of the<br>following:<br>- Clearly articulating scope<br>- Supporting evidence that matches<br>the scope of the hypothesis<br>- Claims that are clearly articulated<br>and supported with statistically<br>significant results or acceptance of<br>the null hypothesis                                   |
|---|--|--|--|--|
| Quality of<br>Writing                           | Exceptional level of all of the<br>following:<br>- Articulation of research goals,<br>background, method, sampling<br>procedures, experimental design<br>description and procedure, results,<br>discussion, limitations, and future<br>work<br>- Justification of key decisions<br>- Writing that ties back to the<br>hypotheses | Proficient/mastery level of most<br>of the following:<br>- Articulation of research goals,<br>background, method, sampling<br>procedures, experimental design<br>description and procedure, results,<br>discussion, limitations, and future<br>work<br>- Justification of key decisions<br>- Writing that ties back to the<br>hypotheses | Marginal/ borderline level of most<br>of the following:<br>- Articulation of research goals,<br>background, method, sampling<br>procedures, experimental design<br>description and procedure, results,<br>discussion, limitations, and future<br>work<br>- Justification of key decisions<br>- Writing that ties back to the<br>hypotheses | Unacceptable level of most of the<br>following:<br>- Articulation of research goals,<br>background, method, sampling<br>procedures, experimental design<br>description and procedure, results,<br>discussion, limitations, and future<br>work<br>- Justification of key decisions<br>- Writing that ties back to the<br>hypotheses |
| Magnitude of<br>Contribution                    | Exceptional level of all of the<br>following:<br>- Statistically significant results with<br>large effect size<br>- Novel contributions compared to a<br>strong established baseline   | Proficient/mastery level of most<br>of the following:<br>- Statistically significant results with<br>large effect size<br>- Novel contributions compared to a<br>strong established baseline   | Marginal/ borderline level of most<br>of the following:<br>- Statistically significant results with<br>large effect size<br>- Novel contributions compared to a<br>strong established baseline   | Unacceptable level of most of the<br>following:<br>- Statistically significant results with<br>large effect size<br>- Novel contributions compared to a<br>strong established baseline   |